

Jonathan Solish, SBN 67609
Aaron Ginsburg, SBN 305706
BRYAN CAVE, LLP
120 Broadway, Suite 300
Santa Monica, CA 90401-2386
Telephone: (310) 576-2156
Jonathan.Solish@bryancave.com
Aaron.Ginsburg@bryancave.com
Attorneys for Defendant
H&R Block Tax Services LLC

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

MILTON DEVORE,)
Plaintiff and Counter Defendant,)
v.)
H&R BLOCK TAX SERVICES LLC,)
et al.,) Case No. 2:16-cv-946-DSF(AFMx)
Defendant and Counter Claimant.) Consolidated With Case No.
CHARLES TODD, et al.) 2:16-cv-4330 DSF (AFMx)
Plaintiffs and Counter Defendants,)
v.)
H&R BLOCK TAX SERVICES LLC,)
et al.,)
Defendant and Counter Claimant.)
STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER¹

¹ This stipulated Protective Order is based substantially on the model protective order provided under Magistrate Judge Alexander F. MacKinnon's Procedures.

1 1. A. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

2 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
3 proprietary or private information for which special protection from public
4 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may
5 be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to
6 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this
7 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to
8 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends
9 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment
10 under the applicable legal principles.

11 B. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

12 This action is likely to involve trade secrets, customer lists and other valuable
13 research, development, commercial, financial, technical and/or proprietary
14 information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any
15 purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential and
16 proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things, confidential
17 business or financial information, confidential and proprietary business planning and
18 assessment templates and metrics, information regarding confidential business
19 practices, or other confidential research, development, or commercial information
20 (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information
21 otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or
22 otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case
23 decisions, or common law, including tax returns, tax payer information, and party
24 medical records. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the
25 prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to
26 adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure
27 that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in
28 preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the

1 litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is
2 justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be
3 designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated
4 without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public
5 manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this
6 case.

7 C. ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF PROCEDURE FOR FILING UNDER
8 SEAL

9 The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this
10 Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information
11 under seal; Local Civil Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed
12 and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court
13 to file material under seal.

14 There is a strong presumption that the public has a right of access to judicial
15 proceedings and records in civil cases. In connection with non-dispositive motions,
16 good cause must be shown to support a filing under seal. *See Kamakana v. City and*
17 *County of Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1176 (9th Cir. 2006), *Phillips v. Gen. Motors*
18 *Corp.*, 307 F.3d 1206, 1210-11 (9th Cir. 2002), *Makar-Welbon v. Sony Electrics,*
19 *Inc.*, 187 F.R.D. 576, 577 (E.D. Wis. 1999) (even stipulated protective orders
20 require good cause showing), and a specific showing of good cause or compelling
21 reasons with proper evidentiary support and legal justification, must be made with
22 respect to Protected Material that a party seeks to file under seal. The parties' mere
23 designation of Disclosure or Discovery Material as CONFIDENTIAL does not—
24 without the submission of competent evidence by declaration, establishing that the
25 material sought to be filed under seal qualifies as confidential, privileged, or
26 otherwise protectable—constitute good cause.

27 Further, if a party requests sealing related to a dispositive motion or trial, then
28 compelling reasons, not only good cause, for the sealing must be shown, and the

1 relief sought shall be narrowly tailored to serve the specific interest to be protected.
2 *See Pintos v. Pacific Creditors Ass'n.*, 605 F.3d 665, 677-79 (9th Cir. 2010). For
3 each item or type of information, document, or thing sought to be filed or introduced
4 under seal in connection with a dispositive motion or trial, the party seeking
5 protection must articulate compelling reasons, supported by specific facts and legal
6 justification, for the requested sealing order. Again, competent evidence supporting
7 the application to file documents under seal must be provided by declaration.

8 Any document that is not confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable in
9 its entirety will not be filed under seal if the confidential portions can be redacted. If
10 documents can be redacted, then a redacted version for public viewing, omitting
11 only the confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable portions of the document,
12 shall be filed. Any application that seeks to file documents under seal in their
13 entirety should include an explanation of why redaction is not feasible.

14 **D. DEFINITIONS**

15 2.1 Action: *Devore v. H&R Block Tax Services LLC, et al.*, 2:16-cv-00946-
16 DSF-AFM, together with *Todd, et al. v. H&R Block Tax Services LL*, et al., 2:16-cv-
17 00946-DSF-AFM (formerly 2:16-cv-04330-DSF-AFM).

18 2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the
19 designation of information or items under this Order.

20 2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of
21 how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for
22 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in
23 the Good Cause Statement.

24 2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as
25 their support staff).

26 2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or
27 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
28 “CONFIDENTIAL.”

1 2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless
2 of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including,
3 among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or
4 generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

5 2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
6 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as
7 an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

8 2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
9 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
10 counsel.

11 2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association or
12 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

13 2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party
14 to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have
15 appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm that
16 has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

17 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
18 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
19 support staffs).

20 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
21 Discovery Material in this Action.

22 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation support
23 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
24 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
25 and their employees and subcontractors.

26 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
27 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

28

1 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material
2 from a Producing Party.

3 3. SCOPE

4 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
5 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
6 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
7 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
8 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

9 Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial
10 judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

11 4. DURATION

12 Once a case proceeds to trial, information that was designated as
13 CONFIDENTIAL or maintained pursuant to this protective order used or introduced
14 as an exhibit at trial becomes public and will be presumptively available to all
15 members of the public, including the press, unless compelling reasons supported by
16 specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance
17 of the trial. *See Kamakana*, 447 F.3d at 1180-81 (distinguishing “good cause”
18 showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from “compelling reasons”
19 standard when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the
20 terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

21 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

22 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.
23 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
24 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
25 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
26 protection only those parts of material, documents, items or oral or written
27 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items

1 or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably
2 within the ambit of this Order.

3 Mass, indiscriminate or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
4 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
5 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
6 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating
7 Party to sanctions.

8 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
9 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
10 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

11 **5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations.** Except as otherwise provided in
12 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
13 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
14 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
15 produced.

16 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

17 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
18 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial
19 proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend
20 “CONFIDENTIAL” (hereinafter “CONFIDENTIAL legend”), to each page that
21 contains protected material. If only a portion of the material on a page qualifies for
22 protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s)
23 (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

24 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for inspection
25 need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated
26 which documents it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and
27 before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be
28 deemed “CONFIDENTIAL.” After the inspecting Party has identified the

1 documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which
2 documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before
3 producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the
4 “CONFIDENTIAL legend” to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a
5 portion of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also
6 must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings
7 in the margins).

8 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party
9 identifies the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the
10 deposition all protected testimony.

11 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and
12 for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on
13 the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the
14 legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information
15 warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the
16 protected portion(s).

17 5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent
18 failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive
19 the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material.
20 Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable
21 efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this
22 Order.

23 6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

24 6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
25 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s
26 Scheduling Order.

27 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
28 resolution process under Local Rule 37-1 et seq.

1 6.3 Joint Stipulation. Any challenge submitted to the Court shall be via a
2 joint stipulation pursuant to Local Rule 37-2.

3 6.4 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
4 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper
5 purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other
6 parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating
7 Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall
8 continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is
9 entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the
10 challenge.

11 7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

12 7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
13 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this
14 Action only for prosecuting, defending or attempting to settle this Action. Such
15 Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the
16 conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a
17 Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL
18 DISPOSITION).

19 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a
20 location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons
21 authorized under this Order.

22 7.2 Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
23 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a
24 Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated
25 “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

26 (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as
27 well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably
28 necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

1 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of
2 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

3 (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
4 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the
5 “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

6 (d) the court and its personnel;

7 (e) court reporters and their staff;

8 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
9 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have
10 signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

11 (g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a
12 custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

22 (i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel,
23 mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

24

25

26

27

28

1 8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED
2 IN OTHER LITIGATION

3 If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation
4 that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as
5 “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

6 (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification
7 shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

8 (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order
9 to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the
10 subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include
11 a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

12 (c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be
13 pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

14 If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with
15 the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this
16 action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the
17 subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s
18 permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking
19 protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions
20 should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action
21 to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

22 9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE
23 PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

24 (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a
25 Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information
26 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
27 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be
28 construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

21 19. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

22 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed
23 Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this
24 Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in
25 writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts
26 to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or
27 persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order.

1 and (d) request such person or persons to execute the “Acknowledgment and
2 Agreement to Be Bound” that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

3 11. **INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE**
4 **PROTECTED MATERIAL**

5 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
6 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other
7 protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal
8 Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify
9 whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for
10 production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence
11 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure
12 of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or
13 work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the
14 stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

15 12. **MISCELLANEOUS**

16 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
17 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

18 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
19 Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
20 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
21 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
22 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

23 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
24 Protected Material must comply with Local Civil Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
25 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
26 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party’s request to file Protected Material
27 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information
28 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

1 13. **FINAL DISPOSITION**

2 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
3 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
4 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in
5 this subdivision, “all Protected Material” includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
6 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
7 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving
8 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same
9 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies
10 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or
11 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,
12 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any
13 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to
14 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
15 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
16 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
17 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
18 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
19 Section 4 for a period of five years after the final disposition of this Action.

20 14. **VIOLATION**

21 Any violation of this Order may be punished by appropriate measures
22 including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

23 ///

24

25

26

27

28

1 IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.
2

3 DATED: June 12, 2017

4 /s/ David J. Glaubiger

5 David J. Glaubiger (SBN 176091)
6 Attorney for Plaintiff Milton Devore

7 DATED: June 12, 2017

8 /s/ Kevin S. Lacey

9 Kevin S. Lacey (SBN 140918)
10 Attorney for Plaintiffs Charles Todd
11 and Sims & Patton, Inc.

12 DATED: June 12, 2017

13 /s/ Jonathan Solish

14 Jonathan Solish (SBN 67609)
15 Attorney for Defendant H&R BLOCK TAX SERVICES LLC

16
17
18 FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

19 DATED: 6/12/2017

20 

21
22 ALEXANDER F. MacKINNON
23 United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on _____ [date] in the consolidated cases of *Devore v. H&R Block Tax Services LLC, et al.*, 2:16-cv-00946-DSF-AFM, and *Todd, et al. v. H&R Block Tax Services LL, et al.*, 2:16-cv-00946-DSF-AFM (formerly 2:16-cv-04330-DSF-AFM). I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order. I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Central District of California for enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of _____ [print or type full address and telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

111

1 Date: _____

2

3 City and State where sworn and signed: _____

4

5 Printed Name: _____

6

7 Signature: _____